

Case studies for the

Eleventh Annual Intercollegiate Ethics Bowl

**To be held at the 79th Annual Meeting of the
Society for American Archaeology**

**Austin, Texas
April 24, 2014**

Sponsored by the

Society for American Archaeology Committee on Ethics,

Register of Professional Archaeologists

and

Society for American Archaeology Board of Directors

Prepared by

**Russell Alleen-Willems, Anna Browne Ribeiro, and Krysta Ryzewski
with contributions from anonymous authors**

Note: Although some of these case studies were inspired by actual events, the scenarios are intended to be educational and hypothetical. Ethics Bowl participants should only consider the information provided in the scenarios below.

Case 1

Beatrix Zara, a junior Professor at Bunker College, was looking forward to directing her first summer field school at the contact-period site of Rainey's Landing. Dr. Zara had spent the previous year planning the excavations alongside her collaborators from the Great River Tribe, many of whom were descendants of the Native Americans who lived near Rainey's Landing centuries ago. The field school attracted students from across the country, all of whom were excited to work on such an important collaborative research project.

On the first day of the field school Dr. Zara gathered the 15 students, staff, and collaborators together for a group photograph that she planned to post on the project website and use in future publications. As she focused the camera on the group, she was shocked to discover that Ben, one of the students, was wearing a cap with the logo of "Chief Bison Buck", a popular National League team's mascot. The logo on Ben's hat was prominent, complete with an over-dramatized figure with a feathered headdress and red skin. It stood out brightly against the forest backdrop.

Dr. Zara lowered the camera and kindly asked Ben to remove his hat for the photo. She thought to herself that she would definitely need to have a one-on-one conversation with him after she took the photo, but she didn't want to embarrass him in front of everyone right then, and she also wanted to hurry up and take the photo before the nearby clouds rolled over. Ben looked puzzled by her request. He pointed to the other students and asked, "Why do I have to take off my hat but they don't?" Dr. Zara responded, "The logo on your hat is totally disrespectful. Your hat is not appropriate attire on this project." Ben grew defensive and replied, "What, the Indian mascot? Are you kidding me?! This is my team! And besides, I'm part Native American and the logo doesn't offend me. If I'm not mistaken this project is run with public grant money, so I should be able to wear whatever I want." Dr. Zara was dumbfounded. Yes, the project was publicly-funded. But she just couldn't bear the thought of having Ben and his hat working alongside her students and collaborators, much less appearing in the images of her fieldwork. The thought of beginning a field season with a confrontation in front of the entire field crew churned her stomach. With all eyes focused on her, she started to think she might be over-reacting.

Case 2

Graduate students from Northern State University, particularly those from the Ecology and Sustainability Department, are known for putting their knowledge to work. Dr. Corinne Fawcett, a recent graduate from this program, focused her research on wildlife and the I-620 corridor. Her findings show that this major thoroughway interrupts a series of older corridors, used not only by large fauna such as moose and bears, but also a series of smaller fowl and mammal species. This research topic had been brought to young Corinne's attention when she noticed that a significant rise in fatal automobile-wildlife collisions was correlated with the expansion I-620 and the associated rise in speed limit.

Two years out, Dr. Fawcett has created an incredible partnership with a local NGO, ALIVE! (Animals Lament Interstate Vehicular Execution!) and succeeded in convincing state authorities to construct a series of three wildlife corridors along I-620. These will be accomplished by means of re-routing or elevation of the existing lanes to permit the safe passage of local fauna. Dr. Fawcett herself has conducted the ecological assessment of the corridor and the re-routing of I-620. A thorough and thoughtful researcher, she has also invited a small Cultural Resources Management firm to assess the area. Happily, the firm finds no remains and the project is allowed to proceed.

In true Northern State form, Dr. Fawcett has also taken this opportunity to use this case study as a teaching opportunity. On the first day of construction work, as the bulldozers begin clearing the first work site, Dr. Fawcett stands before local reporters, explaining the logic behind the re-routing, which she knows will cause significant changes to local traffic patterns. In the evening news, the young doctor appears, speaking earnestly, her image interspersed with video clips taken during her dissertation work, of the arduous or dangerous crossings endured by "our furry and feathered friends."

The next morning, bright and early, Dr. Fawcett and the construction crew are greeted by a solemn vigil. Silent, a large assembly of members from the Northpoint Federated Tribes display placards protesting the destruction of sacred ancestral ground. One of the leaders of the protest steps forward and greets Dr. Fawcett politely. The leader explains that, in the eyes of his group, Fawcett's project is destroying sacred ground, beneath which the waters of their ancestors run. "This place, this water, is essential to our continued existence. We cannot allow this to proceed," he finishes.

Dr. Fawcett is stunned.

Case 3

Kyle enjoyed his year as a graduate student teaching assistant for Professor Stapleton's Introductory Archaeology course. The open online course, a MOOC, was hugely popular, attracting over 100,000 students of all ages and backgrounds from every corner of the globe – even Antarctica! Kyle was especially grateful for the attention that the MOOC brought to his dissertation research on the remote island of Qualito. Professor Stapleton encouraged Kyle to integrate case studies from Qualito into the MOOC course content. This was a perfect opportunity, Kyle thought, to engage the local Qualitans with archaeology in advance of his upcoming summer fieldwork on the island.

The MOOC also had an unexpected payoff for Kyle. The course increased the exposure of Qualito's endangered archaeological resources and drew the attention of funding agencies. Kyle quickly managed to secure funding from a prestigious foundation to conduct a full field season of research at the Qualitan site of Lucho the following summer.

Upon his arrival to Qualito, Kyle visited the Lucho site first and then headed to the local Ministry of Culture to discuss the logistics of the excavations. Kyle was met in the Ministry's parking lot by a small group of Qualitans who expressed interest in participating on his field crew. Kyle thanked the group for their interest but told them that he did not need additional help because he'd already assembled a field crew of students from his university and from the local school who had the requisite archaeological training and fieldwork experience. The group seemed displeased with Kyle's reply and protested, "But we are qualified to dig too! We are archaeology students! We passed the MOOC! We learned that archaeologists believe the past belongs to everyone. What kind of archaeologist does that make you?" Unsure what to do, Kyle invited the group to attend the "open day" at the site in a few weeks. He worried that he might be starting trouble, and wondered if there was more he could have done.

The following day Kyle arrived to the Lucho site with his field crew to begin excavations. Upon stepping out of the truck he was horrified by the sight of dozens of looters' pits dotting the landscape. It was clear that this had been going on for a few months. As he sped back into town to report the looting to the Ministry of Culture, he wondered aloud, "How did this happen? Nobody knew the exact location of this site except me and the Minister of Culture!" And then he had a flashback to the MOOC slideshows and all of the maps of Qualito that he'd used in them. Some of the maps identified the location of unexamined sites like Lucho, he realized.

Case 4

For many years now, the Thompkins Corporation has been trying to establish a train offloading station for exporting mined resources. Geographically, the most stable place for such a station is a piece of land on the country's east coast. The area is also the location of a significant archaeological site, SQ-42, that has meaning to several local indigenous groups, primarily the Suqallish. The largest archaeological site in the county, SQ-42 has been the focus of numerous excavations in the past. In the professional opinion of an archaeology professor at the local university where many of the excavated materials are stored, the site has high potential to contain a number of undiscovered human burials.

The Thompkins Corporation has retained the services of a firm to conduct archaeological surveys and ethnographic interviews to identify cultural resources in the planned area of the train offloading station. However, before the archaeologists could conduct their assessment, the corporation ordered several geological boring tests to identify which areas at the site were geologically stable enough to support the necessary station structures, such as roads and building foundations. Several of these borings damaged the SQ-42 site, cutting down through dense layers of midden and what appears to be a housepit. The Thompkins Corporation was fined for the damage they caused to SQ-42. These funds have been set aside to stabilize the parts of the site affected by the boring holes and to improve the organization and storage of the previously excavated materials at the local university.

The local Suqallish tribe objects to the fine; they see it as a bribe, claiming that the Thompkins Corporation rushed to complete the boring samples to save money in the long run. Knowing full well that the tests might affect SQ-42, the corporation took a gamble, because the fine for damaging the site was smaller than the loss of halting construction operations until completion of the cultural resources survey.

Case 5

Times are tough at Bottom State University. In late March graduate students receive an email from the Departmental Chair announcing that their summer research funding has been cut. A wave of panic immediately hits Crawford. He knows that he must complete his fieldwork this summer in order to finish his dissertation and graduate on time. As he sits sulking in front of the Chair's message at the coffee shop, his friend Monty, the shop's owner, chimes in with a suggestion: "Why not try crowdfunding? It worked for me." From coffee shops to soccer team T-shirts, Monty and his buddies had found ways to fund their ideas through online, crowd-sourced funding. Monty reassures Crawford that a few weeks' of advertising on sites like *Jumpstart* will be all he needs to attract public interest and investment in his archaeological excavations at the Late Woodland-period Dunes Forest Site. With renewed hope, Crawford places a description of his 6-week excavation project and his \$5,000 request on *Jumpstart*. Two weeks later, Crawford reaches the \$5,000 mark, thanks to at least two-dozen investors.

Crawford's subsequent field season is a huge success. Not only does he locate two longhouse platforms, but he also discovers evidence of a lapidary industry at the site that involved the use of rare, exotic minerals.

He is excited to report on the site, the first of its kind in the region, and he quickly publicizes the results on his blog, in local newspapers and in professional newsletters. As soon as word gets out, Crawford is contacted by *Jumpstart* investors. Most of the investors just want to see the finds that he unearthed over the summer. But at least five of them want to collect their share of the profit from his priceless finds. Crawford ignores all of these emails as mere annoyances. As promised, upon completion of the fieldwork he mails the *Jumpstart* investors their "piece of the action" T-shirt bearing the project's logo - an image of a jade frog pendant found during the excavations. Now he has no time to deal with these other outlandish requests when he has a dissertation to finish and a career as a funded researcher to establish. These strangers donated money to *Jumpstart* to fund his excavations, *not* to interfere with his findings, he thinks.

Case 6

The Logi figurines, a group of artifacts sacred to the Ferrara Tribe, were sold to a foreign art collector back in the 1940s by a Ferrara tribal member. The Ferrara Tribe has long contested the sale, saying that, while the tribal member was responsible for caring for the figurines, the member did not have the right to sell the figurines because they belong to the Tribe as a whole. Now, after several decades, the Logi figurines are being sold at auction by a foreign auction house. The Ferrara Tribe, along with several other organizations, has objected to the commercialization of the Logi figurines and requested their return. The foreign auction house is under no legal obligation to comply, however, and it seems unlikely that the figurines will return to the Ferrara people.

Sir Benjamin Collier, the author of several novels that feature dashing archaeologist Rob Trench, heard about the auction of the figurines. Having made lots of money from the Rob Trench books and films, some of which were set in the lands where the Ferrara Tribe live, Collier is privately considering purchasing the Logi figurines anonymously in order to return them to the Ferrara people. Sir Collier approaches his friend, Dr. Mary Spinner, an archaeologist at his alma mater university, for advice on whether to bid for the figurines or not.

Case 7

The city of Gabroo, today largely autonomous was occupied by European colonial forces for the past 100 years. During that time, the resident archaeologists, both native and European, recorded a large number of archaeological sites. As the area became more industrialized, both Gabroo and the larger Republic of Murilia, of which it is a part today, adopted cultural and heritage resource legislation that aimed to inventory significant historical and archaeological sites to consider the impacts new construction would have. Inside Gabroo, the legislation and requirements adopted mirrored that of the European system. This system is drastically different from the legislation passed in mainland Murilia. Five years ago, the European forces transitioned control of Gabroo back to the mainland. During the transition period, cultural resources were documented sometimes according to the European system, sometimes according to the Murilian system. Several major projects, such as the documentation of the infamous Woa Jenuu neighborhood during the construction of a new city park, utilized both systems, leaving much of the data in reports that are not internally consistent and that fluctuate between measurement units, methods, and terminology.

Alexis Guã is an archaeologist working for a company that is building a new pavilion in Woa Jenuu Park. Alexis is having trouble doing his preliminary research into the archaeology of the neighborhood because many of the previous excavations either resulted only in preliminary reports or in no report at all. Alexis recognizes some of the names on the preliminary reports and contacts the previous archaeologists to request more information, but has yet to receive responses. In conversations with colleagues, Alexis learns that the named primary investigators have been notoriously slow to publish their work, in part because even archaeologists working together on the projects could not agree on one system, having believed that either the European or Murilian system was superior. In the intervening years, many of the archaeologists have moved on to other projects or retired, and it seems unlikely that they will ever return to finish documenting this work.

Alexis received his master's degree in the United States. While he has some experience with both the Murilian and European systems as well as the US system, he worries about whether he will be able to appropriately synthesize previous reports in his research, especially when so much information from previous excavations is lacking. Alexis's partners at the construction company would rather he simply write up a summary of whatever information is readily available and then move forward with the cultural resources survey.

Case 8

Michael Harliss, a CRM archaeologist in Kentucky, has been approached by the Expedition Channel to advise them on their new show “The Spotters: Secrets of the Trade,” an educational reality show that follows a family of self-described “history buffs” as they travel the US visiting historical sites and discussing their significance through the artifacts left behind at the sites. Harliss is an expert in historical archaeology and especially the archaeology of the American Civil War. The Expedition Channel would like him to advise the crew on the techniques and “tricks of the trade” archaeologists use to reconstruct events at battlefields, especially where best to focus their survey efforts to find interesting artifacts for discussion on the show.

Michael is excited to be part of what he sees as a potentially huge chance to educate the public about not only the significance of North American historical archaeology, but also about some of the processes involved in forming hypotheses about the past based on physical evidence. Michael does worry, however, about whether the show as a whole could have negative consequences for archaeological sites. Friends of Michael who have appeared on television before for interviews have also warned him that their long, but informative, interviews were substantially edited before they aired and that many of the aspects of archaeology that they stressed, like the importance of spatial context for forming interpretations, were lost in the process.

Case 9

Lissy, a recent graduate in archaeology, is in his first year as State Archaeologist for the National Office of Heritage and Patrimony of New Brinnica. A diligent archaeologist and dedicated public worker, Lissy understands that most of the work that goes toward maintaining his nation's material heritage is clerical work: filing, digitizing, organizing, and re-checking of data. In fact, this is precisely why he was able to secure this post: Lissy is extremely organized. This largely clerical post is just a first step in what will undoubtedly be a long and fruitful career. He hopes one day to become co-Minister of Heritage and Patrimony.

As part of his duties, Lissy's job is to file away cases Heritage Management Reports and associated records from contract projects conducted on State land. One such file, which has recently been submitted digitally, complete with three-dimensional models and biogeochemical reports - standard for Phase II reports in mid-21st-century New Brinnica - requires a final step. In addition to printing on archival paper, still required by the State despite the multiple digital copies kept on their myriad servers, this file has to be cross-referenced with reports filed in the early 2010s, from a neighboring plot of land. Lissy sighs as he leafs through the project, TR-874, the last remaining piece of forested land in the Tau-Rumin Valley, soon to be converted into a mini-mega-mall, unless his supervisor can make a case for the preservation of the small lithic site located on the edge of the river terrace.

The dusty folders from the early 21st century are yellowed and worn, and as Lissy pulls out the relevant records, the folder literally falls apart, scattering records all over the floor of the archive room. He frowns as he stoops to pick the massive pile of papers; half the records are mostly blank, but still contain scraps of information. There are notations about small surface scatters and vague indicators of human presence, which, though far less sophisticated than would have been revealed through modern techniques, seem to hint at patterns similar to those observed at TR-874.

Back at his desk, Lissy spreads out the documents, but it's no use. Over three-quarters of the records lack a site name or number, and he knows there are over 35 sites stored in this accordion file. Next to the entry "GPS coord:" the archaeologist has simply written 124, 207, 331, etc.: integers that undoubtedly corresponded to something more meaningful at some point. Lissy has no way of knowing whether, as he and his supervisor suspect, TR-874 is part of something that was once much bigger. And more importantly, little more than a shred of evidence to present to developers and the Director to effect an embargo on the construction site.

Case 10

Professor Mendez was teaching his favorite class - "Archaeological Ethics". As part of a routine class exercise he asked his students to browse online auction sites like PreView for antiquities with dubious provenience information. It was not uncommon for students to quickly locate projectile points or Roman coins for sale, but he was astounded when Shirley announced to the class that she'd found a priceless engraved roof tile for sale that was advertised as being from the World Heritage site of Zafar. She was outraged that the seller - username "Indy" - hailed from her home state!

Professor Mendez was angered by the PreView listing, but also saw it as a valuable teaching moment. He and the class discussed their options and agreed that they should first contact the seller and inform them of the problems they faced.

The students and Professor Mendez drafted a thoughtful message to "Indy". Expecting an angry encounter, they were caught by surprise when they received a polite reply from "Indy". He said that his grandmother picked up the tile during her trip to Zafar sometime in the 1970s. She'd told him stories about how there were thousands of similar roof tiles littering the abandoned streets of Zafar. The roof tile on PreView may have been one of many, he said, but it was a sentimental item for him, especially since his grandmother had just passed away. "Indy" revealed that he actually had no intention of selling the tile, but was only listing it on PreView so he could use the bids to assess its value for insurance purposes. There was no need to contact the authorities, he urged, because he was the best possible caretaker for the tile. "Indy" stressed that he had no issues about sharing images of the tile with scholars, especially since it had a rare inscription on it.

But it was his last sentence that stunned the class into silence. It read, "I am so impressed with and interested in the focus of your ethics class that I've sent you the tile to share with your class. It's on its way to you now! Please return it to me in the self-addressed, stamped envelope at the end of the semester."